

# National Transportation Safety Board Aviation Accident Final Report

Location: BROWNSVILLE, TX Accident Number: FTW95LA085

Date & Time: 01/09/1995, 1622 CST Registration: N50WT

Aircraft: PIPER PA-31-350 Aircraft Damage: Destroyed

**Defining Event:** 2 Minor, 1 None

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General Aviation - Personal

# **Analysis**

DURING AN INTERNATIONAL CROSS COUNTRY FLIGHT THE PRIVATE PILOT, CERTIFICATED SINGLE ENGINE LAND, EXPERIENCED A DUAL ENGINE POWER LOSS AS HE WAS BEING VECTORED TO THE BROWNSVILLE AIRPORT. FOLLOWING THE ACCIDENT THE AIRCRAFT WAS EXAMINED BY A FEDERAL AVIATION ADMINISTRATION INSPECTOR WHO FOUND THAT THERE WAS FUEL IN THE LEFT FUEL TANK AND THAT THE FUEL SELECTOR WAS IN THE RIGHT TANK POSITION. THE PILOT HAD REPORTED, PRIOR TO LOSS OF ENGINE POWER, THAT HE HAD LOW FUEL INDICATIONS IN THE RIGHT TANK AND THAT HE NEEDED A VECTOR TO BROWNSVILLE. THE AIRCRAFT WAS LANDED IN ROUGH AND UNEVEN TERRAIN, RESULTING IN DAMAGE TO THE STRUCTURE AND WINGS, APPROXIMATELY 1/2 MILE SHORT OF THE RUNWAY.

# **Probable Cause and Findings**

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: THE FUEL STARVATION LOSS OF ENGINE POWER DUE TO THE PILOT'S IMPROPER USE OF THE FUEL TANK SELECTOR. FACTORS WERE THE PILOT'S QUALIFICATION AND THE LACK OF SUITABLE TERRAIN FOR LANDING.

### **Findings**

Occurrence #1: LOSS OF ENGINE POWER(TOTAL) - NONMECHANICAL Phase of Operation: APPROACH - VFR PATTERN - FINAL APPROACH

#### **Findings**

1. ALL ENGINES

2. (C) FUEL TANK SELECTOR POSITION - IMPROPER - PILOT IN COMMAND

3. (F) QUALIFICATION - PILOT IN COMMAND

4. (C) FLUID, FUEL - SWITCHED OFF

-----

Occurrence #2: FORCED LANDING

Phase of Operation: EMERGENCY DESCENT/LANDING

-----

Occurrence #3: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH TERRAIN/WATER

Phase of Operation: EMERGENCY LANDING

#### **Findings**

5. (F) TERRAIN CONDITION - NONE SUITABLE

Page 2 of 5 FTW95LA085

### **Factual Information**

On January 9, 1995, at 1622 central standard time, a Piper PA-31- 350, N50WT, was destroyed during a forced landing near Brownsville, Texas. The airplane was being flown by a private pilot, who was on an international personal cross country flight. A VFR flight plan was in effect and visual meteorological conditions prevailed. The pilot and one passenger received minor injuries, while the remaining passenger was not injured.

According to the flight plan information, the airplane was en route from Cancun, Mexico, to El Paso, Texas. The pilot contacted Corpus Christi, Texas, approach control, while 50 miles east of Brownsville, and stated that he had "low fuel status in the right tank, but thought he had 3 hours of fuel remaining." He then requested and was given a vector to runway 13R at the Brownsville airport. The pilot subsequently reported that he had lost power in both engines. The airplane landed about 1/2 mile short of the airport in unsuitable terrain reulting damage to the fuselage and wings. Initial examination of the wreckage, by a Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) inspector, revealed that there was fuel on board the airplane, in the left tank, and the fuel selector was in the right tank position.

A review of the pilot records by the FAA revealed that the pilot was certificated for single engine operations, did not hold an instrument certificate, and had accumulated a total of 87 hours of flight time.

Repeated attempts to have the pilot or operator submit a completed NTSB Form 6120.1/2 (Pilot/Operator Aircraft Accident Report) were not successful.

#### **Pilot Information**

| Certificate:              | Private                             | Age:                              | 37, Male                   |
|---------------------------|-------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|----------------------------|
| Airplane Rating(s):       | Single-engine Land                  | Seat Occupied:                    | Left                       |
| Other Aircraft Rating(s): | None                                | Restraint Used:                   | Seatbelt, Shoulder harness |
| Instrument Rating(s):     | None                                | Second Pilot Present:             | No                         |
| Instructor Rating(s):     | None                                | Toxicology Performed:             | No                         |
| Medical Certification:    | Class 3 Valid Medicalw/waivers/lim. | Last FAA Medical Exam:            | 02/02/1993                 |
| Occupational Pilot:       |                                     | Last Flight Review or Equivalent: |                            |
| Flight Time:              | 87 hours (Total, all aircraft)      |                                   |                            |

Page 3 of 5 FTW95LA085

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

| Aircraft Make:                | PIPER                    | Registration:                  | N50WT           |
|-------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------------|-----------------|
| Model/Series:                 | PA-31-350 PA-31-350      | Aircraft Category:             | Airplane        |
| Year of Manufacture:          |                          | Amateur Built:                 | No              |
| Airworthiness Certificate:    | Normal                   | Serial Number:                 | 31-7952018      |
| Landing Gear Type:            | Retractable - Tricycle   | Seats:                         | 10              |
| Date/Type of Last Inspection: | Unknown                  | Certified Max Gross Wt.:       | 7000 lbs        |
| Time Since Last Inspection:   |                          | Engines:                       | 2 Reciprocating |
| Airframe Total Time:          |                          | Engine Manufacturer:           | LYCOMING        |
| ELT:                          | Installed, not activated | Engine Model/Series:           | TIO-540-J2BD    |
| Registered Owner:             | GLADYS ENTERPRISES, INC. | Rated Power:                   | 350 hp          |
| Operator:                     | GLADYS ENTERPRISES, INC. | Operating Certificate(s) Held: | None            |

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

| Conditions at Accident Site:     | Visual Conditions       | Condition of Light:                  | Day               |
|----------------------------------|-------------------------|--------------------------------------|-------------------|
| Observation Facility, Elevation: | BRO, 23 ft msl          | Distance from Accident Site:         | 50 Nautical Miles |
| Observation Time:                | 1556 CST                | Direction from Accident Site:        | 10°               |
| Lowest Cloud Condition:          | Scattered / 2200 ft agl | Visibility                           | 10 Miles          |
| Lowest Ceiling:                  | Broken / 2800 ft agl    | Visibility (RVR):                    | 0 ft              |
| Wind Speed/Gusts:                | 12 knots /              | Turbulence Type<br>Forecast/Actual:  | /                 |
| Wind Direction:                  | 160°                    | Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual: | /                 |
| Altimeter Setting:               | 30 inches Hg            | Temperature/Dew Point:               | 24°C / 19°C       |
| Precipitation and Obscuration:   |                         |                                      |                   |
| Departure Point:                 | CANCUN, MX (MMUN)       | Type of Flight Plan Filed:           | VFR               |
| Destination:                     | EL PASO, TX (ELP)       | Type of Clearance:                   | None              |
| Departure Time:                  | 0000                    | Type of Airspace:                    | Class E           |
|                                  |                         |                                      |                   |

# Wreckage and Impact Information

| Crew Injuries:      | 1 Minor         | Aircraft Damage:     | Destroyed |
|---------------------|-----------------|----------------------|-----------|
| Passenger Injuries: | 1 Minor, 1 None | Aircraft Fire:       | None      |
| Ground Injuries:    | N/A             | Aircraft Explosion:  | None      |
| Total Injuries:     | 2 Minor, 1 None | Latitude, Longitude: |           |

Page 4 of 5 FTW95LA085

### **Administrative Information**

Investigator In Charge (IIC): MATTHEW ELLIS, Report Date: 08/23/1995

Additional Participating Persons: FRED J CECH; SAN ANTONIO, TX

Publish Date:

Investigation Docket: NTSB accident and incident dockets serve as permanent archival information for the NTSB's investigations. Dockets released prior to June 1, 2009 are publicly available from the NTSB's

investigations. Dockets released prior to June 1, 2009 are publicly available from the NTSB's Record Management Division at <a href="mailto:publing@ntsb.gov">publing@ntsb.gov</a>, or at 800-877-6799. Dockets released after this date are available at <a href="http://dms.ntsb.gov/pubdms/">http://dms.ntsb.gov/pubdms/</a>.

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB), established in 1967, is an independent federal agency mandated by Congress through the Independent Safety Board Act of 1974 to investigate transportation accidents, determine the probable causes of the accidents, issue safety recommendations, study transportation safety issues, and evaluate the safety effectiveness of government agencies involved in transportation. The NTSB makes public its actions and decisions through accident reports, safety studies, special investigation reports, safety recommendations, and statistical reviews.

The Independent Safety Board Act, as codified at 49 U.S.C. Section 1154(b), precludes the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an incident or accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report. A factual report that may be admissible under 49 U.S.C. § 1154(b) is available <a href="here">here</a>.