

National Transportation Safety Board Aviation Accident Final Report

| Location: | Cross City, FL | Accident Number: | MIA07LA140 |
|-------------------------|---|------------------|-------------|
| Date & Time: | 09/05/2007, 0533 EDT | Registration: | N702PA |
| Aircraft: | CESSNA 208B | Aircraft Damage: | Substantial |
| Defining Event: | | Injuries: | 1 None |
| Flight Conducted Under: | Part 91: General Aviation - Positioning | | |

Analysis

The pilot stated that he was on a repositioning flight to Tampa, Florida. He was cruising at 11,000 feet msl when, with no warning or spool down time, the engine failed. The engine indications instantly went to zero. The pilot declared an emergency to the air traffic controller and was advised that the nearest airport was 29 miles away. He maneuvered the airplane toward the airport and went through the engine failure procedures. The attempts to restart the engine were unsuccessful. The pilot configured the airplane for best glide speed. After gliding for 22 miles, the airplane's altitude was about 300 feet msl. The pilot slowed the airplane to just above stall speed before impacting small pine trees pulling back on the yoke and stalling the airplane into the trees. The engine was examined at Pratt and Whitney of Canada, with Transportation Safety Board of Canada oversight. The engine compressor turbine blades were fractured at varying heights from the roots to approximately half of the span. Materials analysis determined the blade fractures to display impact damage and overheating. The primary cause of the blade fractures could not be determined. There were no other pre-impact anomalies or operational dysfunction observed to any of the engine components examined. Impact damage to the blade airfoils precluded determination of the original fracture mechanism.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: A total loss of engine power during cruise flight due to the fracture and separation of the compressor turbine blades for undetermined reasons. Contributing to the accident was the unsuitable terrain for a forced landing.

Findings

Occurrence #1: LOSS OF ENGINE POWER(TOTAL) - MECH FAILURE/MALF Phase of Operation: CRUISE

Findings

1. COMPRESSOR ASSEMBLY, BLADE - SEPARATION 2. REASON FOR OCCURRENCE UNDETERMINED

Occurrence #2: FORCED LANDING Phase of Operation: EMERGENCY DESCENT/LANDING

Occurrence #3: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH OBJECT Phase of Operation: EMERGENCY LANDING

Findings 3. OBJECT - TREE(S)

Factual Information

On September 5, 2007, about 0533 eastern daylight time, a Cessna 208 B, N702PA, registered to and operated by Paragon Air Express, Inc, as a Title 14 Code of Federal Regulations Part 91 positioning flight, impacted trees during a forced landing following loss of engine power, near Cross City, Florida. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed and an instrument flight rules flight plan was filed. The commercial rated pilot was not injured and the airplane incurred substantial damage. The flight originated from the Mobile Downtown Airport (BFM), Mobile, Alabama, earlier that day, about 0430.

The pilot stated he was on a repositioning flight to Tampa, Florida. He was cruising at 11,000 feet msl when, with no warning or spool down time, the engine failed. The engine indications instantly went to zero. The pilot declared an emergency to the air traffic controller and was advised that the nearest airport was Cross City Airport (CTY), Cross City, Florida, 29 miles away. He maneuvered the airplane toward the airport and went through the engine failure procedures. The attempts to restart the engine were unsuccessful. The pilot configured the airplane for best glide speed. After gliding for 22 miles, the airplane's altitude was about 300 feet msl. The pilot slowed the airplane to just above stall speed before impacting small pine trees pulling back on the yoke and stalling the airplane into the trees. He was able to exit the airplane without assistance. The airplane came to rest eight miles east of the CTY.

A review of Pratt &Whitney of Canada (P&WC) record's determined the engine was overhauled by Pratt & Whitney Engine Services (PWES), Bridgeport, WV on August 1, 2001. New compressor turbine blades were installed at that time. The engine's maintenance records indicated at 5,451 total hours a hot section inspection was completed on June 18, 2005 by PWES Atlanta, GA. On February 2, 2007, at 6,964 total hours, the power section was removed due to a light propeller strike and replaced with a rental unit. The original power section was repaired and reinstalled at 7,165 total hours, completed on March 27, 2007. The maintenance was performed by PWES, Addison, TX. At the time of the accident the engine's Gas Generator section had accumulated 7,507 total hours and the Power section had accumulated 7,279 total hours.

The operator was granted by the FAA, a time between overhaul extension to 4,600 hours in 2005 and was operating on an approved engine condition trend monitoring (ECTM) program in accordance with P&WC Service Bulletin 1703. The aircraft was not equipped with an automated engine parameter data recording system. Review of the ECTM data following the last hot section inspection revealed no deviations dictating a need for maintenance action.

The engine was examined at Pratt and Whitney of Canada, with Transportation Safety Board of Canada oversight. The engine compressor turbine blades were fractured at varying heights from the roots to approximately half of the span. Materials analysis determined the blade fractures to display impact damage and overheating. The primary cause of the blade fractures could not be determined. The blades' microstructure indicated that the blades had been exposed to excessive temperatures. The compressor turbine guide vane ring and all adjacent and downstream components displayed extensive mechanical damage due to contact with the separated compressor turbine blade debris. There were no other pre-impact anomalies or operational dysfunction observed to any of the engine components examined.

Pilot Information

| Certificate: | Commercial | Age: | 44, Male |
|---------------------------|--|-----------------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Airplane Rating(s): | Multi-engine Land; Single-engine Land | Seat Occupied: | Left |
| Other Aircraft Rating(s): | None | Restraint Used: | Seatbelt, Shoulder harness |
| Instrument Rating(s): | Airplane | Second Pilot Present: | No |
| Instructor Rating(s): | None | Toxicology Performed: | No |
| Medical Certification: | Class 2 With Waivers/Limitations | Last FAA Medical Exam: | 11/13/2006 |
| Occupational Pilot: | Yes | Last Flight Review or Equivalent: | 05/07/2007 |
| Flight Time: | 11732 hours (Total, all aircraft), 5470 hours (Total, this make and model), 180 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 60 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 4 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft) | | |

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

| Aircraft Make: | CESSNA | Registration: | N702PA |
|-------------------------------|--|-----------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| Model/Series: | 208B | Aircraft Category: | Airplane |
| Year of Manufacture: | | Amateur Built: | No |
| Airworthiness Certificate: | Normal; Utility | Serial Number: | 208B0702 |
| Landing Gear Type: | Tricycle | Seats: | 2 |
| Date/Type of Last Inspection: | 08/16/2007, Continuous Airworthiness | Certified Max Gross Wt.: | 8785 lbs |
| Time Since Last Inspection: | 53 Hours | Engines: | 1 Turbo Prop |
| Airframe Total Time: | 7844 Hours at time of accident | Engine Manufacturer: | Pratt and Whitney of Canada |
| ELT: | C91 installed, activated, did not aid in locating accident | Engine Model/Series: | РТ6А-114А |
| Registered Owner: | Paragon Air Express, Inc | Rated Power: | 675 hp |
| Operator: | Paragon Air Express, Inc | Operating Certificate(s) Held: | On-demand Air Taxi (135) |
| Operator Does Business As: | | Operator Designator Code: | РА9А |

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

| Conditions at Accident Site: | Visual Conditions | Condition of Light: | Night |
|----------------------------------|-------------------|---|------------------|
| Observation Facility, Elevation: | CTY, 42 ft msl | Distance from Accident Site: | 8 Nautical Miles |
| Observation Time: | 0553 EST | Direction from Accident Site: | 270° |
| Lowest Cloud Condition: | Clear | Visibility | 10 Miles |
| Lowest Ceiling: | None | Visibility (RVR): | |
| Wind Speed/Gusts: | 4 knots / | Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual: | / |
| Wind Direction: | 60° | Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual: | / |
| Altimeter Setting: | 29.96 inches Hg | Temperature/Dew Point: | 27°C / 16°C |
| Precipitation and Obscuration: | No Precipitation | | |
| Departure Point: | Mobile, AL (BFM) | Type of Flight Plan Filed: | IFR |
| Destination: | Tampa, FL (TPA) | Type of Clearance: | IFR |
| Departure Time: | 0230 CDT | Type of Airspace: | |

Wreckage and Impact Information

| Crew Injuries: | 1 None | Aircraft Damage: | Substantial |
|---------------------|--------|----------------------|-----------------------|
| Passenger Injuries: | N/A | Aircraft Fire: | None |
| Ground Injuries: | N/A | Aircraft Explosion: | None |
| Total Injuries: | 1 None | Latitude, Longitude: | 29.625556, -83.291389 |

Administrative Information

| Investigator In Charge (IIC): | Jose Obregon | Report Date: | 05/06/2009 |
|-----------------------------------|---|---|------------------------------|
| Additional Participating Persons: | William Bonatti; FSDO/FAA; Orlando, FL Doug Hardy; Pratt & Whitney of Canada; Quel Ricardo Asensio; Cessna; Wichita, KS Adam Huskins; Paragon; Nashville, TN Denis Deroy; TSB of Canada; Quebec, Canada | , , | |
| Publish Date: | 05/06/2009 | | |
| Investigation Docket: | NTSB accident and incident dockets serve as p investigations. Dockets released prior to June Record Management Division at <u>pubing@ntsb.</u> this date are available at <u>http://dms.ntsb.go</u> | 1, 2009 are public gov, or at 800-877- | ly available from the NTSB's |

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB), established in 1967, is an independent federal agency mandated by Congress through the Independent Safety Board Act of 1974 to investigate transportation accidents, determine the probable causes of the accidents, issue safety recommendations, study transportation safety issues, and evaluate the safety effectiveness of government agencies involved in transportation. The NTSB makes public its actions and decisions through accident reports, safety studies, special investigation reports, safety recommendations, and statistical reviews.

The Independent Safety Board Act, as codified at 49 U.S.C. Section 1154(b), precludes the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an incident or accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report. A factual report that may be admissible under 49 U.S.C. § 1154(b) is available <u>here</u>.