



National Transportation Safety Board Aviation Accident Final Report

Location:	SPRINGFIELD, OH	Accident Number:	ATL89FA066
Date & Time:	01/03/1989, 0812 EST	Registration:	N9034Y
Aircraft:	PIPER PA-31	Aircraft Damage:	Destroyed
Defining Event:		Injuries:	1 Fatal

Flight Conducted Under: Part 91: General Aviation - Other Work Use

Analysis

THE PLT WAS MAKING A CONTRACT CARGO FLT UNDER FAR 91 RULES AND HAD EXPERIENCED ICG ENROUTE. WHEN JUST PAST DAYTON, HE INDICATED THAT HE 'HAD A LITTLE FUEL PROBLEM' AND NEEDED TO GET INTO OSU WITHOUT DELAYS. A SHORT TIME LATER HE INDICATED THAT HE NEEDED TO GO TO THE NEAREST AIRPORT. HE WAS VECTORED TOWARD SGH FOR LDG. HE THEN INDICATED THAT HE HAD LOST AN ENGINE AND A SHORT TIME LATER INDICATED THAT HE HAD LOST THE OTHER ENGINE. THE ACFT CRASHED IN A RESIDENTIAL AREA. THERE WAS NO FIRE AND ONLY RESIDUAL FUEL WAS FOUND IN THE AIRPLANE. THE COMPANY PRESIDENT INDICATED THAT HE DID NOT ENCOURAGE HIS PILOTS TO CARRY 'EXCESS FUEL'. IT WAS REPORTED THAT THIS PILOT, ALONG WITH OTHERS, HAD BEEN 'CHEWED OUT' FOR CARRYING 'EXCESS FUEL'. THE OPERATION SHOULD HAVE BEEN CONDUCTED UNDER FAR 135 RULES SINCE THE COMPANY HAD RETAINED OPERATIONAL CONTROL OF THE OPERATION.

Probable Cause and Findings

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: FUEL EXHAUSTION PRECIPITATED BY THE INADEQUATE FUEL CONSUMPTION CALCULATIONS PERFORMED BY THE PILOT, PRESSURE FROM THE COMPANY PRESIDENT TO NOT CARRY EXCESS FUEL AND IMPROPER IN-FLIGHT PLANNING/DECISIONS BY THE PILOT BY NOT REFUELING ENROUTE BEFORE FUEL WAS EXHAUSTED. CONTRIBUTING TO THE ACCIDENT WAS THE INADEQUATE SURVEILLANCE AND CERTIFICATION OF THE OPERATOR BY THE FAA.

Findings

Occurrence #1: LOSS OF ENGINE POWER(TOTAL) - NONMECHANICAL
Phase of Operation: DESCENT

Findings

1. (C) FUEL CONSUMPTION CALCULATIONS - INADEQUATE - PILOT IN COMMAND
 2. (C) COMPANY-INDUCED PRESSURE - COMPANY/OPERATOR MANAGEMENT
 3. (C) INADEQUATE SURVEILLANCE OF OPERATION - FAA(ORGANIZATION)
 4. (C) FLUID,FUEL - EXHAUSTION
 5. (C) AIRCRAFT PREFLIGHT - INADEQUATE - PILOT IN COMMAND
 6. (C) INADEQUATE CERTIFICATION/APPROVAL - FAA(ORGANIZATION)
 7. (C) REFUELING - NOT PERFORMED - PILOT IN COMMAND
 8. (C) IN-FLIGHT PLANNING/DECISION - INADEQUATE - PILOT IN COMMAND
-

Occurrence #2: FORCED LANDING
Phase of Operation: DESCENT - EMERGENCY

Occurrence #3: IN FLIGHT COLLISION WITH TERRAIN/WATER
Phase of Operation: DESCENT - UNCONTROLLED

Factual Information

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Flight Instructor; Commercial; Flight Engineer	Age:	22, Male
Airplane Rating(s):	Multi-engine Land; Single-engine Land	Seat Occupied:	Left
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Restraint Used:	Seatbelt
Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane	Second Pilot Present:	No
Instructor Rating(s):	Airplane Single-engine	Toxicology Performed:	Yes
Medical Certification:	Class 1 Valid Medical--w/ waivers/lim.	Last FAA Medical Exam:	06/03/1988
Occupational Pilot:		Last Flight Review or Equivalent:	
Flight Time:	1041 hours (Total, all aircraft), 57 hours (Total, this make and model), 660 hours (Pilot In Command, all aircraft), 180 hours (Last 90 days, all aircraft), 47 hours (Last 30 days, all aircraft), 1 hours (Last 24 hours, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	PIPER	Registration:	N9034Y
Model/Series:	PA-31 PA-31	Aircraft Category:	Airplane
Year of Manufacture:		Amateur Built:	No
Airworthiness Certificate:	Normal	Serial Number:	31-47
Landing Gear Type:	Retractable - Tricycle	Seats:	2
Date/Type of Last Inspection:	09/01/1988, Annual	Certified Max Gross Wt.:	6500 lbs
Time Since Last Inspection:	102 Hours	Engines:	2 Reciprocating
Airframe Total Time:	5906 Hours	Engine Manufacturer:	LYCOMING
ELT:	Installed, not activated	Engine Model/Series:	TIO-540-A1B
Registered Owner:	APOLLO II LIMITED	Rated Power:	310 hp
Operator:	APOLLO II LIMITED	Operating Certificate(s) Held:	On-demand Air Taxi (135)

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Instrument Conditions	Condition of Light:	Day
Observation Facility, Elevation:	DAY, 1009 ft msl	Distance from Accident Site:	17 Nautical Miles
Observation Time:	0830 EST	Direction from Accident Site:	276°
Lowest Cloud Condition:	Unknown / 0 ft agl	Visibility	0 Miles
Lowest Ceiling:	Obscured / 200 ft agl	Visibility (RVR):	0 ft
Wind Speed/Gusts:	3 knots /	Turbulence Type Forecast/Actual:	/
Wind Direction:	90°	Turbulence Severity Forecast/Actual:	/
Altimeter Setting:	29 inches Hg	Temperature/Dew Point:	-3° C / -3° C
Precipitation and Obscuration:			
Departure Point:	INDIANAPOLIS, IN (MQJ)	Type of Flight Plan Filed:	IFR
Destination:	COLUMBUS, OH (OSU)	Type of Clearance:	IFR
Departure Time:	0725 EST	Type of Airspace:	Class E

Airport Information

Airport:	BECKLEY MUN. (SGH)	Runway Surface Type:	
Airport Elevation:	0 ft	Runway Surface Condition:	
Runway Used:	0	IFR Approach:	None
Runway Length/Width:		VFR Approach/Landing:	Forced Landing; Straight-in

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 Fatal	Aircraft Damage:	Destroyed
Passenger Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Fire:	None
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	None
Total Injuries:	1 Fatal	Latitude, Longitude:	

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	WALTER G STINER	Report Date:	05/22/1990
Additional Participating Persons:	JOHN DUNCAN; CINCINNATI, OH GEORGE SHIRK; CINCINNATI, OH GREGORY ERICKSON; WILLIAMSPORT, PA LEWIS MASON; VERO BEACH, FL		
Publish Date:			
Investigation Docket:	NTSB accident and incident dockets serve as permanent archival information for the NTSB's investigations. Dockets released prior to June 1, 2009 are publicly available from the NTSB's Record Management Division at pubinq@ntsb.gov , or at 800-877-6799. Dockets released after this date are available at http://dms.nts.gov/pubdms/ .		

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB), established in 1967, is an independent federal agency mandated by Congress through the Independent Safety Board Act of 1974 to investigate transportation accidents, determine the probable causes of the accidents, issue safety recommendations, study transportation safety issues, and evaluate the safety effectiveness of government agencies involved in transportation. The NTSB makes public its actions and decisions through accident reports, safety studies, special investigation reports, safety recommendations, and statistical reviews.

The Independent Safety Board Act, as codified at 49 U.S.C. Section 1154(b), precludes the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an incident or accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report. A factual report that may be admissible under 49 U.S.C. § 1154(b) is available [here](#).